

# THE STATES assembled on Tuesday 28th November 2017, at 09.30 a.m. under the Presidency of the Bailiff, Sir William James Bailhache.

His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor, Air Chief Marshall Sir Stephen Dalton, G.C.B., LL.D. (Hon.), D.Sc. (Hon.), B.Sc., F.R.Ae.S., C.C.M.I. was present.

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.26 a.m.)

Senator Sir Philip Martin Bailhache – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 12.32 p.m.)

Connétable Sadie Anthea Le Sueur-Rennard of St. Saviour – en défaut

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.38 a.m.)

Deputy John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré of St. Lawrence – ill

Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.26 a.m.)

Deputy Richard John Rondel of St. Helier – ill

Deputy Richard John Renouf of St. Ouen – en défaut

Deputy Louise Mary Catherine Doublet of St. Saviour – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.26 am.)

Prayers read by the Greffier of the States

### Tribute to the late Mr. Leonard Victor Percy Nightingale, former member of the States

The Bailiff paid tribute to the late Mr. Leonard Victor Percy Nightingale, former Deputy of St. Saviour.

The States observed one minute's silence as a mark of respect.

### Students from Université de Toulouse - Welcome

The Bailiff, on behalf of all members, welcomed students from the Université de Toulouse, accompanied by Dr. David Marrani and Professor Wanda Mastor, who were present in the public gallery.

### **Documents presented**

Fiscal Policy Panel Annual Report: response of the Minister for Treasury and

R.126/2017.

Resources

Presented: 28th November 2017.

Minister for Treasury and Resources.

Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – La Boulangerie, La Ruette de la

R.127/2017.

Ville à l'Evêque, Trinity – sale (Assisted House Purchase Scheme).

Presented: 28th November 2017.

Minister for Infrastructure.

## **Notification of lodged propositions**

Jersey Infrastructure Levy: approval in principle (P.100/2017) – amendment.

P.100/2017.

Amd.

Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré of St. Lawrence.

Draft Howard Davis Farm (Arrangements for further Abrogation of Covenant) (Jersey)
Law 201- (P.105/2017): amendment.

Amd.

Lodged: 28th November 2017.

Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré of St. Lawrence.

Future Hospital: approval of preferred scheme and funding (P.107/2017) – P.107/2017. amendment. Amd.

Lodged: 28th November 2017.

Connétable of St. John.

Future Hospital: approval of preferred scheme and funding (P.107/2017) – second amendment. P.107/2017. Amd.(2)

Lodged: 28th November 2017.

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf.

### Draft Budget Statement 2018 P.90/2017

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources entitled 'Draft Budget Statement 2018' (P.90/2017) and, adopting paragraph (1) of an amendment of the Connétable of Grouville (P.90/2017 Amd.(2)), agreed that after the words "as set out in the Budget Statement", there should be inserted the words "except that, in relation to vehicle emissions duty, rates shall be increased by 5%".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 35 CONTRE: 8 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator P.F. Routier Senator S.C. Ferguson Senator P.F.C. Ozouf Connétable of St. Clement Senator A.J.H. Maclean Connétable of St. Ouen Senator I.J. Gorst Connétable of St. John Senator L.J. Farnham Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Senator A.K.F. Green Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Deputy A.D. Lewis (H) Connétable of St. Helier Deputy S.M. Bree (C) Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of St. Mary

Deputy E.J. Noel (L) Deputy of St. John

Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

Connétable of St. Brelade Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of Grouville Connétable of Trinity Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Deputy of Grouville Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) Deputy of Trinity Deputy M. Tadier (B)

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)

Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)

Deputy of St. Peter

Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)

Deputy R. Labey (H)

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

Deputy M.J. Norton (B)

Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)

Deputy of St. Mary

Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)

Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (2) of the amendment of the Connétable of Grouville, agreed that, after the words "as set out in the Budget Statement", there should be inserted the words "except that the estimate of income from taxation during 2018 shall be increased by £2,100,000 by amending the band limits which apply to the application of vehicle emissions duty in relation to the manufacturer's  $CO_2$  emission specifications in line with the table below –

Established CO2 mass
emission
Figure in grams
0–50
51–75
76–100
101–125
126–150
151–175
176–200
201 or more

Members present voted as follows -

POUR: 33 CONTRE: 10 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator P.F. Routier
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
Senator A.J.H. Maclean
Senator I.J. Gorst
Senator L.J. Farnham
Senator A.K.F. Green
Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Connétable of St. Martin
Connétable of Grouville
Connétable of Trinity
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy of Grouville

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) Deputy of Trinity Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy E.J. Noel (L) Deputy of St. John Senator S.C. Ferguson Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of St. Mary Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Brelade Connétable of St. John Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Deputy A.D. Lewis (H) Deputy S.M. Bree (C)

Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)

Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)

Deputy of St. Peter

Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)

Deputy R. Labey (H)

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

Deputy M.J. Norton (B)

Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)

Deputy of St. Mary

Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)

Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)).

## Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the Minister for Treasury and Resources had informed the Greffier of the States that his amendment (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)Amd.) to the amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)) to the proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources entitled 'Draft Budget Statement 2018' (P.90/2017) had been withdrawn.

### Draft Budget Statement 2018 P.90/2017

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources entitled 'Draft Budget Statement 2018' (P.90/2017), as amended, resumed consideration of an amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)).

### **Roll Call**

Following the lunchtime adjournment the Bailiff, in accordance with Standing Order 56(2), directed that elected members be summoned as the Assembly was inquorate. In accordance with Standing Order 56(2), having allowed such time as he considered reasonable for elected members to return to the Chamber, the Presiding Officer asked the Greffier to call the roll, as he believed that the States remained inquorate. The following members were present in the Chamber for this second roll call —

Senator P.F. Routier

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf

Senator A.K.F. Green

Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Lawrence

Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Brelade

Connétable of St. Martin

Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of Trinity

Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)

Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

Deputy of St. Martin

Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)

Deputy S.M. Bree (C)

Deputy M.J. Norton (B)

Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)

Deputy of St. Mary

Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)

After the roll had been taken, the States remained inquorate and the Bailiff, in accordance with Standing Order 56(3), suspended the meeting for 10 minutes.

## Draft Budget Statement 2018 P.90/2017

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources entitled 'Draft Budget Statement 2018' (P.90/2017), as amended, rejected paragraph (i) of the amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)) that at the end of paragraph (a), there should be inserted the words "except that the inbound duty-free allowance for cigarettes is reduced to 40 (and, for tobacco products, to 50g) with effect from 3rd April 2018, raising estimated additional income of £1,500,000.".

Members present voted as follows –

**CONTRE: 39** POUR: 2 **ABSTAIN: 2** 

Connétable of St. Brelade Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S) Senator P.F. Routier Senator A.J.H. Maclean

Senator I.J. Gorst

Senator P.M. Bailhache

Senator A.K.F. Green

Senator S.C. Ferguson

Connétable of St. Helier

Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Martin

Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of St. John

Connétable of Trinity

Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

Deputy of Grouville

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)

Deputy of Trinity

Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

Deputy M. Tadier (B)

Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

Deputy of St. John

Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)

Deputy of St. Martin

Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)

Deputy of St. Peter

Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf Connétable of St. Lawrence

Deputy A.D. Lewis (H) Deputy R. Labey (H)

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

Deputy S.M. Bree (C) Deputy M.J. Norton (B)

Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)

Deputy of St. Mary

Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)

Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (ii) of the amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)) that at the end of paragraph (a), there should be inserted the words "except that a 10% rate of tax is applied to Class 1 bookmakers, raising estimated additional income of £250,000.".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 8 CONTRE: 34 ABSTAIN: 1

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

Senator P.F. Routier Senator A.J.H. Maclean Senator I.J. Gorst Senator P.M. Bailhache Connétable of St. Brelade

Senator A.K.F. Green Senator S.C. Ferguson Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Lawrence

Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of St. John

Connétable of Trinity

Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

Deputy of Trinity

Deputy M. Tadier (B)

Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

Deputy of St. John

Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)

Deputy of St. Martin

Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)

Deputy of St. Peter

Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)

Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)

Deputy R. Labey (H)

Deputy S.M. Bree (C)

Deputy M.J. Norton (B)

Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)

Deputy of St. Mary

Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)

Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (iii) of the amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)) that at the end of paragraph (a) there should be inserted the words "except that the new Income Tax levied on large retailers is applied to large liquor vendors, raising estimated additional income of £450,000."

Members present voted as follows -

#### POUR: 4

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)

### **CONTRE: 37**

Senator P.F. Routier Senator A.J.H. Maclean Senator I.J. Gorst Senator P.M. Bailhache Senator A.K.F. Green Senator S.C. Ferguson Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. John Connétable of Trinity Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Deputy of Grouville Deputy of Trinity Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy E.J. Noel (L) Deputy of St. John Deputy J.M. Maçon (S) Deputy S.J. Pinel (C) Deputy of St. Martin Deputy R.G. Bryans (H) Deputy of St. Peter Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H) Deputy A.D. Lewis (H) Deputy R. Labey (H) Deputy S.M. Bree (C) Deputy M.J. Norton (B) Deputy T.A. McDonald (S) Deputy of St. Mary Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)

**ABSTAIN: 2** 

Connétable of St. Brelade Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (iv) of the amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)) that at the end of paragraph (a) there should be inserted the words "except that a new Stamp Duty rate of 10% is introduced for residential properties sold for more than £10 million to people newly arrived in the Island, raising estimated additional income which will depend on the number of properties purchased."

Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)

Members present voted as follows -

### POUR: 14 CONTRE: 29 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf Senator P.F. Routier Connétable of St. Lawrence Senator A.J.H. Maclean Connétable of Grouville Senator I.J. Gorst Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Senator P.M. Bailhache Deputy of Grouville Senator A.K.F. Green Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) Senator S.C. Ferguson Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Connétable of St. Helier Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Connétable of St. Clement Deputy J.M. Maçon (S) Connétable of St. Peter Deputy A.D. Lewis (H) Connétable of St. Ouen Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S) Connétable of St. Brelade Deputy R. Labey (H) Connétable of St. Martin Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H) Connétable of St. John Deputy T.A. McDonald (S) Connétable of Trinity Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Deputy of Trinity Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy E.J. Noel (L) Deputy of St. John Deputy S.J. Pinel (C) Deputy of St. Martin Deputy R.G. Bryans (H) Deputy of St. Peter Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H) Deputy S.M. Bree (C) Deputy M.J. Norton (B) Deputy of St. Mary Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (v) of the amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)) that at the end of paragraph (a) there should be inserted the words "except that the new Income Tax levied on large retailers is levied at the rate of 10% rather than 20%, reducing estimated income by £2,800,000.".

Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 14 CONTRE: 29 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf Senator P.F. Routier Connétable of St. Helier Senator A.J.H. Maclean Connétable of St. Clement Senator I.J. Gorst Connétable of St. Ouen Senator P.M. Bailhache Connétable of St. Brelade Senator A.K.F. Green Connétable of St. John Senator S.C. Ferguson Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Peter Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Connétable of St. Lawrence Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) Connétable of St. Martin Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Connétable of Grouville Deputy A.D. Lewis (H) Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H) Deputy of Grouville Deputy M.J. Norton (B) Deputy of Trinity Deputy G.J. Truscott (B) Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

Deputy of St. John
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
Deputy R. Labey (H)
Deputy S.M. Bree (C)
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(1)(b), Senator Paul Francis Routier, M.B.E., Senator Lyndon John Farnham and the Connétable of St. Peter declared an interest, but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate on the amendment of Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf (P.90/2017 Amd.(4)).

### Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier that the Assembly adjourn.

Members present voted as follows -

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
Senator A.K.F. Green
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)
Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
Deputy R. Labey (H)
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)

Senator P.F. Routier Senator A.J.H. Maclean Senator I.J. Gorst Senator P.M. Bailhache Connétable of St. Brelade Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. John Connétable of Trinity Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Deputy of Grouville Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) Deputy of Trinity Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy of St. John Deputy S.J. Pinel (C) Deputy of St. Martin Deputy R.G. Bryans (H) Deputy of St. Peter Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
Deputy S.M. Bree (C)
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)

Deputy of St. Mary

Connétable of St. Helier

# Draft Budget Statement 2018 P.90/2017

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources entitled 'Draft Budget Statement 2018' (P.90/2017), commenced consideration of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (P.90/2017 Amd.).

## Adjournment

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 29th November 2017 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources entitled 'Draft Budget Statement 2018' (P.90/2017) and accompanying amendments, and other outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.25 p.m.

DR. M. EGAN

Greffier of the States